TRIPADVISOR SENTIMENT ANALYSIS: THE POLICY OF ECOTOURISM COMPETITIVENESS FROM BROMO, TENGGER, AND SEMERU NATIONAL PARK

Joshi Maharani Wibowo, SE
Dr. Dra. Sri Muljaningsih, M.Sp
Dias Satria, SE., M.App.Ec., Ph.D

ABSTRACT

Ecotourism Bromo, Tengger and Semeru National Parks (TNBTS) tourism in protected areas that have high competitiveness and unique characteristics in Indonesia. The current TNBTS ecotourism management policy is still dominated by policies to maximize TNBTS competitiveness without regard to environmental conditions and biodiversity of TNBTS. Therefore this study was conducted to identify the implications of 5A (Attraction, Amenities, Accessibility, Accommodation, and Activity) for increasing BTSNP competitiveness based on the data of tourist reviews on TripAdvisor. The results of the study show that policies implication to encourage TNBTS competitiveness is still lacking, especially related to accessibility and amenities. So to overcome this problem, the government is trying to create another attraction around the TNBTS area that has a smaller scale, but can be controlled from the start and have a more equitable impact on local communities.

Keywords: Ecotourism, 5A competitiveness, sentiment analysis, BTSNP

INTRODUCTION

The tourism sector in the global perspective, was one sector that has a high demand both domestically and globally. Based on World Economic Forum (2017) research for the last 6 years, tourism sector has been able to survive in the uncertainty of global economy. Not only that, tourism sectors have a positive impact for creating 262 million new jobs in 2016. The tourism sector in Indonesia has been increasing a lot especially in 2017, based on World Economic Forum (2017) in tourism sectors Indonesia got 42th rank (climbing eight places after 2016). This increased occurred because Indonesia government try to maximize natural and cultural potential in the tourism sector. This makes tourism sector in Indonesia is a leading sector that is expected to replace Indonesia’s foreign exchange in the mining, oil and gas, rubber, and palm oil sectors, which has continued to decline since 2015 (Bank Indonesia, 2019). In 2030, oil and gas are no longer used as the main fuel for the transportation and world industry since it is not environmentally friendly (WorldBank, 2015). This growth is inversely proportional to growth in the tourism sector. In 2007 Indonesia’s tourism growth reached 22%; this number far exceeds the average growth of global and regional tourism, which amounted to 6.4% and 7%. This growth carried out together with the branding of “Wonderfull Indonesia” and “Pesona Indonesia” with the achievement of 46 awards in 22 countries in 2015, 27 awards in 13 countries in 2017, and 30 awards in 8 countries in 2018 (Ministry of Tourism, 2018).

Bromo Tengger Semeru National Parks (BTSNP) are the main destinations in the Asian Continent besides Mount Hallasan (South Korea) and Mount Kinabalu (Malaysia). Most of these three mountain enthusiasts come from Spain, Italy, Belgium, the Netherlands, India, and France (Bank Indonesia, 2019). The economic policy has its uniqueness in managing the ecotourism of BTSNP. As it is an area that prioritizes as a protected area for conservation, according to the Decree of the Director-General of KSDAE No.SK.381/KSDAE/SET/KSA.0/9/2016. Where the zone to conduct BTSNP ecotourism activities is in the utilization zone, with a percentage of 2.37% of the total BTSNP land area of 50,276.2 ha (BBTNBTS, 2019). Generally, the principle of tourism policy that implemented policies must guarantee the country and the region to get the maximum benefit from the social and economic contribution made by tourism (Priambodo, 2015). However, due to the unique characteristics of BTSNP as a protected area, this policy must be supplemented by other policies that attentionally to environmental conditions. Tourism economic policies to enhance competitiveness in BTSNP are not only obliged to create economic benefit and social contributions, but also maintain environmental sustainability. It is important to create social, economic, environmental, and tourism integration through increasing the competitiveness of BTSNP ecotourism activities.

BTSNP currently has the advantages of competitiveness internationally known as sunrise and Mount Bromo crater, which is known as the largest crater in South East Asia (primary data, 2019). Unfortunately, it is not enough to improve BTSNP competitiveness that can integrate social, economic, environmental, and tourism aspects through the ecotourism activities. The sentiment analysis in this study has an important role in coding the competitiveness of BTSNP in five categories; attractiveness, amenities, activities, accessibility, and accommodation. Another study, as well as this study, has been carried out by environment-based tourism, such as a study written by Saura, Rayes-Menendez, and Alvarez-Aloncio (2018) focusing on tourism industries accommodation that is a hotel, where online comments (TripAdvisors) directly affect the sustainable management of environmentally-based accommodation. Schuckert, Liu, & Law (2015) concluded that social media reviews directly affect individuals or organizations in consuming/buying goods/services offered online, including in the tourism sector. Online data based on the five decades has been able to shift the use of offline mass media to online-based mass media. Online reviews are more easily accessible to the public, able to contribute significantly to improving competitiveness, and better planning of tourism economic policies for BTSNP (Fruman & Molletas, 2016).
RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses secondary and primary data. The main secondary data is the BTSNP visitor review on TripAdvisor platform (data mining) about 564 reviews from 39 countries, including Indonesia. This data will be support by relevant secondary data obtained through the Bromo, Tengger, and Semeru National Park Centers and other online platforms such as the Ministry of Tourism and online newspapers. The primary data obtained through interviews and FGD (focus group discussions) in August – November 2019. Sampling from the two data uses a purposive sampling method, where the main informant is the community as a business actor from the BTSNP area, while the supporting informants are from BBBNTBTS as the main government party managing BTSNP and BTSNP business agents from outside the BTSNP area.

Data analysis will be carried out qualitatively using sentiment analysis and descriptive qualitative phenomenology. The related data from TripAdvisor will be coded based on five categories of 5A competitiveness theory; Attraction, Amenities, Accommodation, Activity, and Accessibility (Abdullah, 2017). After going through the coding process, the data will be validated using interviews and FGD data following qualitative research procedures (Moleong, 2010). Sentiment analysis is an analysis that gives limits to the data processed; the limits used in this study are positive, negative, and neutral sentiments (Saura et al., 2018). This limitation is applied to the 5A competitiveness to determine the positive, negative, and neutral BTSNP competitiveness. Data analysis was performed using Nvivo 11 Pro which is an application that specializes in analyzing qualitative data (Bandur, 2016). After the data is code in five categories and three sentiments in each category, the output data will be displayed in various forms, such as word cloud, graphics, and treemaps, to facilitate the result analysis and discussion related to BTSNP ecotourism competitiveness policy.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

ATTRACTION

The attraction is the potential possessed by BTSNP to attract tourists, and it can be natural, social, or biological capital (Tseng, Lin, Remen Lin, Wu, & Sripohon, 2019). BTSNP currently has two main types of attractions that are natural and social capital owned by local people, especially the Tengger community. Based on Figure 1 shows that BTSNP attracts a large amount of natural capital consisting of 14 categories, while the social capital has only two categories that are local event and “Luhur Poten” Temple.

Coding results related to the attractiveness of BTSNP showed that 9.34% were negative, 18% were neutral, and 72.67% were positive. The natural capital of BTSNP has a higher value in competitiveness, especially the attractiveness of BTSNP compared to social capital. BTSNP natural capital, Mount Bromo, has a very high review about a 487-word count, which means it is an attraction that has the highest competitiveness. Social capital as an attraction of BTSNP is not too sought or attractive for tourists to visit BTSNP. It comes from 85 villages in the area around BTSNP. People from those 85 villages are involved in various tourism activities such as the Yadnya Kasodo ceremony or the International Jazz Mountain festival that held annually. It is called the cultural uniqueness of BTSNP social capital (Tseng et al., 2019). However, TNBT’s social capital is held in periodic or annual. Most of the BTSNP local events are held in June–August, which is the peak season of BTSNP.
AMENITIES

Figure 2. BTSNP amenities

Four types of BTSNP amenities that are most wanted are rent jackets, selling masks, toilet, and restaurant. Amenities are a category related to tourism competitiveness created due to demand from consumers, which is visitors. The forms/types of amenities needed and available in the tourism area are created more flexibly according to the needs of visitors, the ability of local communities, and related stakeholders to meet those needs (Libosada, 2009). The needs of visitors are very diverse according to their itinerary. Currently BTSNP has four major categories of amenities that can meet the needs related to amenities, food and beverage, and attire of visitors who adjust to BTSNP temperature and cold weather conditions.

Coding results related to BTSNP amenity showed 45.76% were negative, 34.38% were neutral, and 19.85% were positive. BTSNP amenities show a partly negative sentiment. It caused by the lack of eligibility conditions or BTSNP amenities compared to the number of BTSNP visits. For example a toilet, its number is few and only provided in certain areas, besides it also has a high price of about Rp.5000 with not feasible conditions. The current BTSNP amenities are one of the BTSNP competitiveness categories which reduce its competitiveness as ecotourism.

ACCOMMODATION

Figure 3. BTSNP accommodation

Accommodation is an important component in tourism competitiveness because it covers transportation costs by tourists in an area, including BTSNP (Farahani, 2013). The area around BTSNP has three main types of accommodation, such as hotels, guesthouses, and apartments, also other facilities related to lodging that are camping, which often done in Ranupani and Mount Semeru. Those three main accommodations are mostly located in Cemoro Lawang, Probolinggo, and several BTSNP tourists do the activities in BTSNP but utilize accommodation from outside this area such as Malang or Probolinggo.

Coding related BTSNP accommodation shows that 7.94% are negative, 49.21% are neutral, and 42.86% are positive. More sentiments are neutral than negative. Many reviews regarding BTSNP accommodation state that it still not feasible, but the price offered is very expensive. It caused by the lack of eligibility conditions or the lack of BTSNP amenities compared to the number of visitors. Although each tourist has different preferences regarding accommodation, most of them prefer an accordance price accommodation with provided facilities (Farahani, 2013). Thus BTSNP neutral sentiments occur because most visitors prefer to
choose accommodation outside that area, which has an accordance price with the facilities offered even they require more time and cost to get BTSNP.

ACTIVITY

Activity is an interesting tourism product that is carried out in the tourism area (Pitchayadejanat & Nakpathom, 2018). They also stated that the more activities carried out in a tourist area, the higher the competitiveness of its. It is due to the many activities that attract tourists’ interest and motivation to visit and do activities in the tourist area. Based on Figure 4 it can be concluded that BTSNP has ten types of activities such as seeing sunrise and sunset, hiking and climbing volcanoes (Mount Bromo and Mount Semeru), taking pictures (selfies, landscape photos and more), riding horses, seeing and walking around Pura Luhut Poten, walking in the desert, local festival (Mountain Jazz and Yadnya Kasodo’s traditional ceremonies), other natural landscapes, night scenes and stars before sunrise, and jeep traveling. The most popular activities based on Figure 4 are hiking Mount Bromo or seeing the crater or taking pictures of the area.

Coding results related to BTSNP activity showed that 9.28% were negative, 22.36% were neutral, and 68.35% were positive. Activities in BTSNP mostly have positive sentiments, which means activity is one of the categories that support its competitiveness. A good activity is the one that provides experience to tourists. The more experience provided through tourism activities in BTSNP, the higher the spending money level by visitors, and it will have a good impact on the competitiveness of BTSNP (Bentz, Lopes, Calado, & Dearden, 2016). The ten types of activities in BTSNP have provided good experience to visitors but still needs to develop into good and sustainable activities, such as low carbon tourism activities to maintain the environmental quality of BTSNP as a protected area (He, Huang, & Xu, 2018).

ACCESIBILITY

Accessibility in the tourism sector, as a social context of local communities, is a public policy to improve a better quality of life for local people. While in the context of visitors it is an infrastructure that makes it easy for the tourist to access transportation to and carry out tourism activities (Natalia, Clara, Simon, Neolia, & Barbara, 2019). They also stated that the accessibility of tourism was created because of a collaborative process between stakeholders (government, community, and
visitors) to carry out a policy that allows them to deliver universal tourism products and services. The current accessibility in BTSNP mostly traversed by land, although there is some access through sea and air routes, it still needs transiting from those two accesses to land routes.

Coding results related to the accessibility of BTSNP showed 20.15% were negative, 52.50% were neutral, and 27.35% were positive. BTSNP is currently accessible through four entrances, and they are from Probolinggo, Pasuruan, Malang, and Lumajang (BBTNBTS, 2018b). Based on the four entrances, Probolinggo has the best entrance in which conditions for access using land vehicles. BTSNP coding results related to accessibility are still quite high negative because of it fairly far from the airport and port. Besides, other entrances are still relatively inaccessible. The entrance from Pasuruan is still very uphill if accessed using a motorbike, while the entrance from Lumajang is very inadequate because 75% of the roads are still uneven and interspersed with forest. Public vehicles to get BTSNP can only access through the entrance from Probolinggo in the form of a minivan, which is currently still very limited.

BTSNP COMPETITIVENESS INSIDE AND OUTSIDE THE PROTECTED AREAS

Figure 6. BTSNP competitiveness word cloud

BTSNP has fairly high competitiveness in the category of attraction and activity. However, the BTSNP ecotourism competitiveness policy in the last ten decades is still not following the principle of BTSNP as a protected area. The BTSNP ecotourism policy only seeks to increase visitors to create a multiplier effect where BTSNP can open new jobs and increase national income through the tourism sector without regard to the condition of protected areas (Priambodo, 2015). Protecting the protected areas that have other potentials such as biodiversity is considered to be a cost burden for the local and national government. Currently, in managing the ecotourism of BTSNP, the government conducts environmental and social-based competitiveness policies to provide more benefits to the community while maintaining the environmental quality of BTSNP.

INSIDE THE PROTECTED AREAS

In protected areas, BBTN.BTS is currently developing tourism based on adventure, which is considered to be the type of tourism that is most suitable for the condition of BTSNP as a protected area. That adventure tourism is bird watching. It is carried out in BTSNP because BTSNP has a biological potential that is 20 types of rare animals, Law No.50 of 1999 protects three of them, it states about Conservation of Biological Natural Resources and their Ecosystems, as well as Republic of Indonesia Government Regulation No.77 of 1999 concerning Preservation of Plant and Animal Species such as the Javan Eagle, which is a species that is enshrined as the symbol of Indonesia and better known as Garuda (Prasetyo, Widodo, Rahmadan, Winear, & Siswoyo, 2018). Despite having a very specific market, this type of tourism can be sold at very high prices and has a minimum negative environmental impact. Unfortunately, despite being able to contribute a significant amount of national income, bird watching has not been able to provide significant positive externalities to the local community.
OUTSIDE THE PROTECTED AREAS

The policy to increase BTSNP competitiveness outside the area is carried out in the buffer village area. BBTNBTs has succeeded in developing Edellweis Village as one of the ecotourism attractions around BTSNP but at the outside area stipulated in the law, which is located in Wonokitri and Ngadisari Village with the branding of “Harmony and Conservation.” Different from the previous bird watching, Edellweis Village has a direct impact on the environment and local communities. Edelweiss flowers that were once a rare flower now become developed and can be traded both in dried flower products, souvenirs, and tourism products. The existence of Edellweis Village in the area around BTSNP is expected to be able to extend the length of stay of tourists and increase spending money in the area. Another social impact with the existence of Edellweis Village is to increase the participation of local communities to preserve Edelweiss flowers as well as to develop educational-based tourism that not only provides more knowledge to the local community but also visitors (BBTNBTs, 2018).

CONCLUSION

TNBTS competitiveness policy based on 5A still does not meet the needs of TNBTS in the tourism sector, especially in the category of accessibility and amenities that have a high negative sentiment. The infrastructure related to these 2 categories is still very weak, because infrastructure related to accessibility and amenities not only a few and rarely finding but also not feasible and cannot accommodate too many visitors especially during peak season. So in overcoming these problems the BBTNBTs is trying to create new tourist attractions that meet the 5A criteria at a minimum but on a smaller scale such as Edellweis Village and Bird Watching.

IMPLICATION

Based on the conclusions related to the research about BTSNP competitiveness, the author suggests creating a TNBTS development strategy in the long run. The strategy was developed based on the perspective in the economic, environmental, technological, cultural, and tourism sectors and was implemented through 1 policy (not in separated policy). The results of the TNBTS ecotourism policy implications are expected to encourage the overall competitiveness of TNBTS ecotourism.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Thanks to Bank Indonesia Malang as the main supporter in the financial sector and other supporting facilities so that this journal can be completed. Besides, we also thank all respondents who supported this study, such as the BBTNBTs, local communities, and BTSNP business operators outside the BTSNP area.

REFERENCES


